



Appendix H

Project Evaluation Memo



DATE	Friday, December 22, 2017
TO	File
FROM	Richard Perrin, AICP
REGARDING	Route 96 Transformative Corridor Strategic Infrastructure Plan Project Evaluation

Introduction

Funding for transportation improvements (infrastructure and services) is significantly less than demonstrated needs. To ensure that these limited funds are put to the highest and best use, communities have an obligation to evaluate the anticipated benefits of the transportation investments they propose. This memo describes the evaluation that was conducted on the proposed alternatives to identify those projects that would ultimately serve as the recommendations of the Route 96 Transformative Corridor Strategic Infrastructure Plan (the Plan). It contains the following sections:

1. Project Identification
2. Project Evaluation
3. Project Results

Project Identification

A significant amount of planning has been undertaken in Victor and, as would be expected, improving safety and easing traffic congestion have been goals of this planning as it has related to transportation. As part of the Plan, planning efforts since 1999 were thoroughly reviewed and cataloged. These included Town and Village, Ontario County, Genesee Transportation Council, and Finger Lakes Regional Economic Development Council plans, studies, regulations, standards covering land use, transportation, economic development, and natural and human-caused hazards. Appendix A of the Plan contains a summary of the recommendations from these previous plans and studies, which number approximately 20 in total.

The data and recommendations of previous planning initiatives were combined with input from the public via two public meetings and a survey as well as a bus tour of stakeholders to identify the universe of alternatives to be considered. An initial qualitative screening of these alternatives was conducted to determine how they met the stated highest priority of the public: to address excess delay along the Route 96 corridor. This screening included input from the Steering Committee for the Plan on likely benefits, and led to the identification of projects for detailed evaluation. Appendices E and F include the input received via the public meetings and the survey.

Project Evaluation

As the primary goal of the Plan is to decrease congestion (and thereby improve safety – rear end accidents accounted for half of all accidents along Route 96 per the Town’s Comprehensive Plan of 2015), the bulk of the identified projects were evaluated and refined based on the outputs of traffic models developed exclusively for the Plan. The traffic models were built in a software application that is an industry standard, combining macroscopic analysis and microsimulation capabilities (Trafficware’s Synchro and SimTraffic, respectively). Existing and new traffic counts, travel times from INRIX, and projections of future volumes and speeds from the GTC Travel Demand Model served were utilized to create the traffic models. Three models were developed for the Plan:

1. Current Year Model: Replicates current conditions with respect to traffic volumes and speeds using existing roadway configurations and locations and timing of traffic signals. It was calibrated to recent counts and travel time data to provide a base for the development of the other two models.

2. 2040 No-Build Model: Projects conditions in 2040 with respect to traffic volumes and speeds using existing roadway configurations, locations and timing of signals, and the addition of the programmed roundabout at Route 96 and Lynaugh Road. This roundabout is expected to be built in 2019 and represents the only planned improvement in the Plan area.
3. 2040 Build Model: Projects conditions in 2040 with respect to traffic volumes and speeds using the various future roadway configurations and locations and timing of signals based on the addition of the programmed roundabout at Route 96 and Lynaugh Road and the projects identified for evaluation.

While the primary means of evaluation of the identified projects were the traffic models, the following other elements were reviewed:

- State Regulated Freshwater Wetlands;
- Significant Natural Communities;
- Rare Plants and Animals
- Federal Estuarine, Marine, and Freshwater Wetlands; and
- Threatened and Endangered Animals and Plants.

Of these elements, wetlands south of Route 96 and along Victor Mendon Road (Route 251) near its intersection with Route 96 were identified. In addition, two Threatened Animals could be present in the Plan area. The Northern Long-Eared Bat (*Myotis septentrionalis*) and Bog Turtle (*Clemmys muhlenbergii*) are known to or are believed to occur in Ontario County.

Project Results

Ultimately, six high-priority projects were selected for advancement as the recommendations of the Plan:

1. New Local Street along Ontario Central Railroad
2. Route 96 3-Lane to 5-Lane Conversion
3. Route 251/Lane Road Connection
4. Omnitech Place/Willowbrook Road Connection
5. Plastermill Road/Collett Road/Delray Drive Connection
6. Lane Road/Victor Egypt Road/Lynaugh Road Roundabout

If these projects are implemented, the arterial Level of Service (LOS) along the Route 96 Corridor during the evening peak hour in 2040 will be LOS C for southbound traffic and LOS D for northbound traffic. No intersections are projected to have a LOS worse than E in 2040 (intersection LOS is provided in the table on the following page).

While a benefit cost analysis is outside the scope of the Plan, an initial calculation of the value of travel time savings were calculated (using a 7 percent net present value discount rate and U.S. Department of Transportation recommended hourly values of travel time savings in 2016 dollars per person-hour) based on the comparative results of the 2040 No-Build Model and the 2040 Build Model. The results of this analysis indicate that when vehicle operating cost savings, safety improvements, emissions reduction benefits, and property value increases resulting from the implementation of the projects are factored in, the implementation of the six high-priority projects will result in benefits that exceed costs.

Intersection LOS (PM Peak)			
Intersection	Existing 2017	Future No Build 2040	Future Build 2040
Church Street (unsignalized)	C	A	A
Moore Ave./Maple Ave.	C	C	C
School St.	B	B	-
High St.	E	E	A
Railroad Road & Maple - NEW	-	-	C
Railroad Road & School - NEW (Roundabout)	-	-	A
Rte. 251	A	E	-
Rte. 251/Lane Road - NEW	-	-	C
Railroad Road - NEW (Unsignalized)	-	-	B
Omnitech Pl./ Willowbrook Rd. - NEW	-	-	C
Rowley Rd./Main Street Fishers	D	F	E
Benson Road (unsignalized)	A	A	A
I-490 WB On-Ramp/Off-Ramp	A	B	B
Commerce Dr.	B	C	D
High St.	C	D	C
Cobblestone Ct.	C	D	C
Turk Hill Rd.	C	C	C
Commons Blvd.	B	C	C
Rte 250	B	B	B
Woodcliff Dr.	F	F	D
I-490 Exit 28	B	C	B